REPORT OF A COMPREHENSIVE VISIT

TO

Alliance Theological Seminary
Nyack, NY

Monday, February 22, 2010 to Thursday, February 25, 2010

for

The Board of Commissioners of
The Commission on Accrediting of the
Association of Theological Schools

EVALUATION TEAM

THE BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS OF THE COMMISSION ON ACCREDITING OF THE ATS

Team Chair: Roger L. Loyd, Director, Divinity Library, Duke University Divinity School
Efrain Agosto, Academic Dean and Professor of New Testament, Hartford Seminary
Thomson K. Mathew, Dean, School of Theology and Missions, Oral Roberts University
Shawn Oliver, Associate Academic Dean, Ashland Theological Seminary (Puerto Rico visit only)
Tisa Lewis, Association of Theological Schools
1. Brief description of Alliance Theological Seminary

Alliance Theological Seminary (Nyack, NY) was founded in 1960 as the Jaffray School of Missions, a graduate school of Nyack College. From the beginning, it emphasized the interaction between theological studies and the social sciences. The institution was renamed as Alliance School of Theology and Missions in 1974. In 1979, the name changed again to Alliance Theological Seminary, and the first MDiv degree was offered.

The institution is owned by the Christian and Missionary Alliance (C&MA). The seminary has founded extension campuses in many locations; currently, the extension campus in Kiev, Russia, is concluding its work as it completes work on the current cohort of students, projected to occur in 2011. Its other more permanent extension sites are in New York City (which it regards as a second campus, begun in 1997) and in San Juan, Puerto Rico (begun in 1985).

Alliance Theological Seminary was granted initial accreditation by the Association of Theological Schools in 1990. It was reaccredited in 2000.

In 2001, the C&MA voted to link Nyack College and Alliance Theological Seminary under one President, and in 2003, voted to affirm the “university model” which administratively restructured the entire institution under a President and four Vice Presidents, and created eight schools, of which the seminary is one. The Dean of the seminary reports to the Provost (one of the four Vice Presidents).

Though the seminary was founded to offer education to missionaries and pastors in the C&MA, it broadened its mission to educate students from all denominations who identify with its objectives and wish to participate in its programs. This is its fiftieth year of service.

2. Accreditation History (since last visit)

2001: Approved granting of MA, MPS, and MDiv degrees in Manhattan, NY.
2003: Approved granting of MDiv degree in San Juan, Puerto Rico; approved granting of MDiv and MPS degrees in Redding, CA.
2005: Received notification that the Redding, CA, and western Pennsylvania sites were discontinued as extension sites; granted preliminary approval of the comprehensive distance education program.
2006: Granted preliminary approval to offer the DMin.
2007: Approved the change of nomenclature from MA [Intercultural Studies] to MA in Intercultural Studies.
2008: Seminary notified ATS of its suspension of use of the Dayton, OH, extension site.
2009: Approved the New York City extension site as a complete degree extension site for the MDiv, MPS, and MA [Biblical Literature] degrees; received report of the discontinuance of the Master of Counseling degree; received report of the closing of the Kiev extension site by 2011.
II. GENERAL INSTITUTIONAL STANDARDS

1. Purpose, Planning and Evaluation

1.1 Purpose

Alliance Theological Seminary, a graduate school of Nyack College, is the national seminary of the Christian and Missionary Alliance (C&MA). As a multicultural evangelical theological seminary located in Nyack, New York, with major extensions in New York City and Puerto Rico, its mission is to develop “in men and women a personal knowledge of God and his work in the world in order to equip them for the ministry of the gospel of Jesus Christ and the expansion of his church.” The seminary’s mission is rooted in its history and heritage. In keeping with its founder A. B. Simpson’s desire to produce “World Christians” rather than ethnocentric followers of western Christianity, the seminary endeavors to develop in its students a growing understanding of the cultures and peoples to whom they would be sent. This “biblical and cultural mandate” remains “central to the identity and purpose of the seminary.”

The seminary sees itself as a “university-embedded” institution within the larger body of Nyack College and believes that its mission is closely linked to the institutional mission of Nyack College. Although it seems to identify well with the core values adopted by the College, it has not yet conducted a comprehensive review of its mission statement in light of the changes within the Seminary and in its relationship to the College and the sponsoring denomination at large.

The Alliance Seminary community is well aware of the schools’ mission and purpose and of its need for a detailed review of these in its current context which has gone through “enormous contextual and structural changes.” According to the self-study report, a review of the school’s mission and purpose is scheduled to begin in fall 2010. The site team considers this an important commitment.

1.2 Planning and Evaluation

Alliance Seminary has entered the beginning stages of a strategic planning model. For instance, a strategic planning committee has been added to the governance structure of the seminary in fall 2008 and the committee’s responsibilities have been clearly delineated. The seminary is expected to develop a strategic plan for guiding its institutional decisions for a 3–5 year span. This plan will be coordinated with the College’s Strategic Plan 2009-2012. Alliance’s history of starting extension sites and offering degree programs with unclear nomenclature and inconsistent requirements resulting in abrupt closures strongly suggests the need to give special attention to intentional academic planning within the seminary’s overall strategic planning.

In terms of the assessment of student learning and overall institutional evaluation, the seminary has worked hard to put a good system in place. Positive steps taken to improve program assessment in the seminary include appointment of degree program directors, the hiring of a deeply committed Director for Assessment who will be working closely with the College’s Assistant Provost for Assessment, and scheduling of annual assessment review with the Institutional Assessment Committee. These reviews are to evaluate the data generated by assessment for strategic planning purposes and to evaluate the assessment process itself. The site team found that significant progress has been made to establish an assessment program.
which encompasses student development, degree program evaluation and overall institutional evaluation. The involvement of Spiritual Formation courses, Field Education program, and intentional mentoring opportunities in the assessment process is commendable. The seminary went through what it calls a “re-engineering” of the MDiv program. Several significant changes were made to the curriculum which was implemented in fall 2006. A systematic review of data from the new curriculum has not been done.

The site team recommends requiring a report by November 1, 2012, regarding the assessment of the “re-engineered” MDiv degree (ATS Commission Standard 1, section 1.2.2 and Degree Program Standard A, section A.5).

2. Institutional Integrity

The college of which Alliance Theological Seminary is a graduate school has a clear and consistent statement of purpose; it employs those statements of purpose in creating the institution’s five core values (socially relevant, academically excellent, globally engaged, intentionally diverse, personally transforming). The seminary connects all of its planning, goals, and guiding principles to the institution’s purpose and core values. The institution represents its accreditation accurately in printed materials and in other ways (such as on its website), and the seminary carries out its educational programs and institutional activities according to the standards and procedures of the Association of Theological Schools. The seminary prepared well for the visiting team at all of its three locations: Rockland, Manhattan, and Puerto Rico.

The seminary and its parent institution conduct their business in accord with all applicable laws, so far as the visiting team could tell. Though the audit of the past year found a minor inconsistency in the way the college reported a few cases regarding financial scholarships, the institution has rectified the oversight through training its staff and establishing new processes. The school’s published materials accurately represent it to its various constituencies, including prospective students, students, faculty, staff, and the general public, including the churches served by the institution. All materials use gender-inclusive language with reference to persons.

The seminary has recently revised and published a handbook for faculty, another for staff, and the catalog and other documents for students. Spelled out in those documents are the seminary and institutional commitments to treating people in ethical ways, and grievance procedures are described in detail.

The students, faculty, and staff at all three locations are a fine example of diversity in many respects (race, gender, denomination, and the like). Of particular note are the seminary’s programs to serve students from Chinese and Korean churches. Not only is the student body diverse, but the institution seeks to use that diversity educationally. In exit interviews for 2006-2009, an average of 80% of students said their seminary experience was “very helpful” to them in learning to contextualize ministry to diverse cultures (Self-Study, p. 23). As noted elsewhere, the faculty has become increasingly diverse since the last self-study, and the board is also reflecting a greater diversity, though more could always to be done.

The site team supports the Dean’s idea to create a guide to comprehensive operating procedures (noted on page 25 of the Self Study), so that personnel turnover does not disrupt important processes of the school, such as assessment, state and accrediting reporting processes, and strategic planning.
3. Learning, Teaching and Research: Theological Scholarship

In the tasks of teaching, learning and research, Alliance Theological Seminary emphasizes "method, modeling and mentoring" (Self-Study, p.26). Skills in theological study and ministry are learned in a variety of settings, such as classroom, worship, online, field education and in two geographic areas in the New York Metropolitan area (Nyack and Manhattan). Professors teach their subject areas, but also take pride in mentoring their students for ministry and service, locally and worldwide. Professors also focus their theological research in ways that enhance their classroom teaching and allow them to model for their students the intersection between theological teaching and scholarship, and the practice of ministry.

3.1 Activities of Theological Scholarship

Learning at Alliance is a collaborative venture between an able and committed faculty, an enthusiastic and diverse student body, and two distinct but interconnected geographic areas (quiet, suburban Nyack and busy, downtown Manhattan), separated by about an hour drive-time. Serious attempts are made by faculty, administration, students and the curricular structure to link these two diverse campuses. Students are encouraged to take classes at either one, but only one course requirement (mandated by the New York State Education department) sends Manhattan students to Nyack at least once during their studies. No such requirement exists for Nyack-based students, although many do take advantage of enhancing their learning experience by venturing to Manhattan. Although Alliance holds strongly to its denominational traditions and celebrates them, the denominational and racial-ethnic diversity on both campuses enhances the teaching-learning experience as well, as testified to by both faculty and students.

Teaching at Alliance is focused on both the subject areas of the theological curriculum, namely basic ministerial training as well as biblical and theological formation, but also spiritual and personal formation. The life experiences of both teachers and students become part of the teaching-learning experience, as well as opportunities for global and urban learning. Faculty do interact with each other to develop courses and revise curriculum as evidenced by the process they described for "re-engineering" the MDiv curriculum and writing their self-study, which brought both Manhattan and Rockland faculty to the table for planning, dialogue and testing of new programs, courses and ideas. Teaching at Alliance also engages the social and global context, with many opportunities for students to travel around the world, both in study abroad experiences as well as courses in such places as Israel, Greece, Africa. Asia and Puerto Rico (where they have an extension campus also visited by members of the team). Cross-cultural learning is part of the teaching focus of the faculty and curriculum, as well as learning to apply what is learned in class to ministry and mission (see Self-Study, p.28).

What helps, in part, this focus on ministry skills training and mentoring in the teaching-learning dynamic is a faculty that has significant ministry experience as a whole, and some still retain pastorates even as full-time professors. This is especially true of the Manhattan campus. This latter reality impacts research capacity in terms of faculty publications. However, at the same time, there is a kind of life research and reflection that nourishes the teaching-learning experience for students. A faculty, whether in theology, Bible or ministry, that has ministry experience as a base, including reading, reflection and writing from that experience, can impart to their students the importance of life-long learning and research for ministry. This is an obvious strength of Alliance Seminary as observed by the visiting team. This approach is
evidenced in the kinds of research assignments given to students in most courses they experience in the curriculum, especially those preparing students for basic ministerial service.

Another strength of the theological learning that takes place at Alliance is the very carefully structured and monitored field education program. It is a three-pronged approach, including an initial year of spiritual formation, a second year of actual field education practice, and a third year of learning to be mentors for others, both first year students and for life-long ministry after seminary. Students – on both campuses – as well as faculty and especially field education supervisors had high praise for this program, as did the visiting team.

3.2 Characteristics of Theological Scholarship

Even with this focus on research that nourishes ministry practice as the basic characteristic of the theological scholarship of Alliance Seminary, more publishing in this area would enhance the collaborative contribution of teaching, learning and research of Alliance to the wider theological and ministerial enterprise. Nonetheless, there is no doubt that the theological scholarship of Alliance faculty and students crosses many boundaries particularly those of church and society, as well as the academy. The diverse publics influenced by Alliance faculty include the various churches and denominations represented in the student body and the faculty. While loyal to its Christian and Missionary Alliance roots, the theological scholarship of the seminary faculty and students comes from a wide variety of evangelical traditions. This is especially true in its urban New York campus where faculty include Baptists, Presbyterians and Pentecostals, as well as life-long and newer Alliance adherents. The student body is even more diverse with Pentecostal, African Methodist Episcopal, Baptists and Independent groups among the students interviewed by the visiting team. This wide denominational diversity within evangelicalism contributes to a rich exchange of ideas about the role of religion and faith in the wider public. With its Master of Arts in Intercultural Studies degree, in particular, as well as the long tradition of global mission work of both the denomination and the Seminary, as well as Nyack College, there is no doubt that the theological scholarship of Alliance has wide-ranging global impact, with many of its students experiencing study and ministry abroad, as well as preparing for mission work abroad. The Nyack campus in particular has a significant international participation, especially with its Chinese and Korean Studies programs. Thus the school does well in encouraging global awareness as part of teaching, learning and theological scholarship. Freedom of inquiry, within evangelical traditions of scholarship in terms of faith commitments that are affirmed, is maintained at Alliance Seminary. The diversity of traditions, geography and global and urban awareness allows this freedom of inquiry to be rich and authentic.

4. The Theological Curriculum

Alliance Seminary offers three master’s level degrees that are ministerial in nature – the Master of Divinity, the Master of Professional Studies (with concentrations in counseling, urban ministry, church development and several ethnic studies tracks), and the Master of Arts in Intercultural Studies. It has one academically-oriented Master of Arts – the MA [Biblical Literature] (Old Testament or New Testament) and one advanced professional degree – the Doctor of Ministry (still awaiting New York State approval). Besides the specific goals of each degree, the overarching goals for the theological curriculum are clearly stated in Alliance Seminary materials – education in the essentials of theological education (religious heritage, cultural context, personal and spiritual formation, and practical skills of ministry); integration between theological knowledge and ministry skills; globalization of theological education in
terms of ministry and mission; contextualization of theological learning for an understanding of culture; and personal, spiritual and professional formation. All of these goals are demonstrably integrated into the programs and courses of the theological curriculum and an attempt is also made to show how these curricular goals relate to the overall institutional goals of the parent university, Nyack College (i.e., to be academically excellent, globally engaged, intentionally diverse, personally transforming and socially relevant).

III. DEGREE PROGRAM STANDARDS

Basic programs oriented toward ministerial leadership

A. Master of Divinity (MDiv)

The MDiv is the largest program at Alliance Seminary, accounting for more than 56% of the seminary’s students. The degree’s goals have been developed to line up with the core values of the College. The MDiv curriculum underwent a “re-engineering” process in 2006. It is reported that the re-engineering sought to make the degree “more academically rigorous, more socially relevant, more educationally integrated, and more global in scope.” Compared to the previous curriculum, the re-engineered version does allow more flexibility for the students to tailor their degree to their personal and professional needs. However, the new curriculum implemented in 2006 has not been evaluated yet, but the faculty is anticipating “making some needed adjustments” which were not listed in the self-study.

As previously mentioned, the MDiv program goals are clearly stated and aligned to the core goals of the College. The degree is offered in three locations. The new curriculum represents a renewed emphasis on spiritual formation in response to feedback received from pastors, denomination leaders, and faculty that the old curriculum was producing graduates who lacked spiritual maturity required for Christian ministry. However, as noted before, its impact has not been measured yet. The degree is designed to follow a developmental model with three phases: Person Phase, Church Phase and Ministry Phase.

The MDiv students follow a 12-step assessment model keyed to various student learning goals. The new Assessment Director has done a good job of designing a model and she has the support of the program director and the Field Education office, but data needs to be collected and evaluated to see the strengths and weaknesses of the program. There is an MDiv program development plan in place with short-term and long-term goals identified. At this point, it is only a plan. The self-study report expresses concern about retention of MDiv students (currently 69%) and about the number of graduates entering parish ministries (currently 24%). There is a commitment to look at the reasons for these trends.

The site team is concerned about a seminary where both students and faculty are commuters. Community building must remain a concern at Alliance, especially for the sake of MDiv students, and consideration needs to be given to the staffing necessary to guide this effort.

The site team recommends requiring a report by November 1, 2012, regarding the assessment of the “re-engineered” MDiv degree (ATS Commission Standard 1, section 1.2.2 and Degree Program Standard A, section A.5).
C.1. Master of Arts in Intercultural Studies (MAIC)

The MAIC program seeks to prepare students for leadership in cross-cultural Christian service, whether in the United States or in the rest of the world. The degree was given its present name in 2007 after a review by the Association of Theological Schools, and became a degree intended to train students for a professional Christian ministry, not primarily for further research. It is worth noting that in places in the current Catalog, the former designation—"M. A. (Intercultural Studies)"—is still used, as on page 51.

The MAIC degree requires 54 credits, and is a two-year residential degree, offered only at the Rockland campus, though field experiences and ethnography interviews take place throughout the tri-state area, especially in New York City. The degree includes mostly required courses (45 credits, with only 6 credits being available as electives). The degree also requires a three-credit summative project, consisting of either a comprehensive examination or a Second Continent Experience Writing Project (which few students complete), describing the student's experience in working in another country in a Christian mission or similar role.

MAIC students highly value the training they receive in culture and diversity learning, as well as their spiritual formation. The signature course (IC602) is one in ethnographic field research methods, preparing students to do field interviews in New York City in a cultural group different from their own. Other emphases in the degree program are missional themes in Christian history and current practice, and proficiency in biblical knowledge.

The assessment plan for the degree is well-considered, consisting of the final paper in IC602; preparation by each student of a personal plan for spiritual growth and vitality (a Spiritual Growth Covenant), with the exit interview including each student's spiritual formation; and the summative experience, either the comprehensive examination or the Second Continent Experience Writing Project. For each assessment, rubrics have been developed to make certain that all students are judged on the same standards. The assessments are being gathered but have yet to be analyzed and taken back to the faculty for improvements in the degree program's offerings, though several recent changes were already noted in the self-study.

C.2. Master of Professional Studies (MPS)

According to the self-study report, the goals of the MPS program focus on training men and women for Christian ministry and service in the local church and the world through a curriculum that strives to balance studies in Bible, theology, and the social sciences. The MPS program also seeks to incorporate development of ministry skills. While everyone at Alliance seems to understand the goals of the degree, the status of their fulfillment is not very clear to them. This degree has struggled with an identity crisis at Alliance which is reflected in the variations in its curriculum and credit requirements in the past. Alliance acknowledged this issue and an attempt was made to correct it through a "re-engineering" of the curriculum similar to the effort within the MDiv program. This revision undertaken in 2006 reduced the number of required credit hours from 65 to 48. While maintaining 27 credits of core courses (that are also required in the MDiv program), the new MPS allows students to tailor their degree to their personal and professional needs. The impact of this revision has not yet been evaluated. According to the self-study report, the revision will be evaluated by the faculty "soon and some adjustments to this new curriculum are expected." The report does not say what these adjustments might be. The site team considers the promised program evaluation an important commitment.
An eight-step assessment plan based on identified learning goals of MPS has been designed. The plan is very similar to the MDiv assessment plan. The site team encourages Alliance to continue implementation of the proposed plan.

Although the MPS program enrollment has steadily grown at each of the three campuses for the first seven years of the last decade, the growth has tapered off during the last two years. The relationship between the decline in enrollment and the “re-engineering,” if any, is unknown. A study is needed to determine why students are unable to complete the degree.

According to the testimonies the visiting team heard, lack of community is a problem in the MPS program as it is in the MDiv program. Attrition in this program may be partially related to the lack of community. Community building must remain a concern at Alliance. The team encourages Alliance to consider appointing a catalyst for community building. This could be a newly created position or the assignment of a new portfolio to a current faculty member.

The strength of the MPS degree program is in the potential of its goal to produce whole people for specific leadership in Christian service by bringing into dialogue the various dimensions of theological education. These dimensions are (1) church and academy, (2) theology and social science inquiry, (3) the biblical world and the contemporary world, (4) classroom and experience, (5) character and competence, and (6) wisdom and skill. The major weakness of the current MPS with seven “tracks” is that it is now a degree of all things to all people and therefore lacking any clear focus. Presently a student can choose any course within one of seven areas to create his or her own “track.” The addition of the spiritual formation component based on feedback from constituents and the preliminary efforts to implement a reliable assessment plan have strengthened the degree program; however, evaluation of the program must consider if having seven “tracks” that are completely self-directed by fully independent students will fulfill the ambitious goals of this degree. Additionally, consideration must be given to the impact on the faculty of offering this many courses for the tracks (49 courses in 7 tracks). Burnout of the regular faculty or over-dependence on adjuncts looks like a possibility. The site team observed that the MPS needs a clearer focus based on a comprehensive needs analysis of the students and their respective fields of service.

**Basic programs oriented toward general theological studies**

**E.1. Master of Arts [Biblical Literature] (MABL)**

The MA (Biblical Literature) is a 54-credit degree with Old and New Testament emphases that seeks to provide its students with strong biblical foundations, especially for those who wish to go to do more graduate work in the field, or take teaching positions in church and mission agencies and schools. There are currently about 60 students in the program, in both the Rockland and Manhattan campuses. Most of these are lay leaders who will use their degree for teaching Bible in their churches. Some will go on to do PhD. However the quality of the student varies. All are hard-working, according to the faculty director for the program, but their academic preparation for graduate work varies. Since only a 2.5 GPA is required for graduation, most students will in fact not qualify for PhD programs. The program director is a faculty member who teaches mostly in the Manhattan campus. He indicates that students can take this degree with or without a language track. The non-language track focuses on biblical exposition.
Of the 18 full-time faculty members, there are five biblical studies professors - two in Old Testament and three in New. Two of these five are based in the Manhattan campus (one in Old Testament and one in New Testament). They seem to cover the curriculum required for this program well, with the help of adequate adjunct faculty support. Some of the Bible faculty also teach course overloads, both to cover the curriculum, as well as to supplement their salaries. Library resources and research training for this degree, between the two campus libraries, online resources, interlibrary loan, and other local libraries to which students have access are sufficient for this degree, although the Manhattan campus library needs more study space. Biblical studies courses encourage library research time, although professors often provide Xeroxed copies of exegetical materials for Manhattan students in particular given their busy schedules for school and work. One Bible faculty member indicated teaching five courses in one semester, including overloads. Enrollments in his classes were healthy - 50 in a required Greco-Roman world course, 25 in a book elective (1-2 Corinthians), 7 in Greek language, 20 in the required Reading the New Testament course, and 20 in a book study of Revelation. This represents an unusually heavy load for an Alliance Seminary faculty member, but at the same time it shows the healthy enrollments in most biblical studies classes, keeping in mind, as the MA (BL) coordinator reminded a visiting team member, that there is less of a Bible requirement in the MDiv degree now than before its revision in 2006. It might be helpful that faculty program directors work more closely with the Dean and other faculty members, both in and out of the field, in order to ensure more dialogue and integration with the curriculum development and planning functions of the seminary.

**Advanced programs primarily oriented toward ministerial leadership: Doctor of Ministry (DMin)**

Alliance has a Doctor of Ministry degree on the books, with ATS approval, but it cannot be advertised or recruited for because of a hold-up in New York State approval due to a companion graduate degree in Organizational Management at Nyack College that needs further review. In conversations with the Director of the DMin degree, who was hired three years ago to design and implement the program, it seems that there are some 150 potential applicants ready to apply for the 20 spots in the first DMin cohort. The program is well-designed with foci in Pastoral Theology, Missiology, and Leadership for Changing Global Landscape. Potential participants will include C&MA clergy from around the country, regional clergy from other denominations, and international leaders in the Director's ministry network. The curriculum structure for the program includes two years of intensive January and June seminars with the cohort, followed by elective courses related to the individual student's particular interest within the curriculum and then a major research and writing ministry project. There will also be an oral examination of the project. Consideration of the urban environment as part of the global reality being studied is made possible for this degree because of the Alliance Manhattan campus and the cooperation of the Associate Dean for the urban campus. Besides the Director, a select number of Alliance Seminary faculty and a Visiting Resident faculty when the cohorts are on campus will be involved in supporting this degree. The visiting team was impressed by the leadership, design and enrollment potential for this program.

**Advanced programs primarily oriented toward theological research and teaching (if any): None.**
5. Library and Information Resources

5.1 Library Collections

The libraries that serve the seminary are part of the larger Nyack College library system, which is administered by an Associate Dean of Libraries (ADL). The theological librarians report to the ADL. The entire library system has a collection development policy, which is well-designed and which indicates how the mission of the libraries is congruent with the mission of the institution.

The collection size (both in printed materials and in electronic ones) is modest; at the end of 2008, the total collection (all subjects) was 172,649 volumes (it is unclear from the self-study whether the total also includes the volumes in the library in Puerto Rico), with 38,625 of those being in the Rockland campus Alliance collection. The libraries offer about 100 electronic databases, including the ATLA Religion Database. In the subject division of databases, the one for religion, theology and ministry lists fourteen titles, which seem well-selected to support the seminary’s degree programs. The libraries have acquired a substantial number of electronic books (especially important in light of the commitment to distance education). Moreover, the libraries participate in WALDO, a regional consortium of academic libraries which share a common online catalog, allowing for a wider variety of collections to be available to Alliance readers.

The statistics cited for expenditures on collections in the self-study might be cause for alarm, in that they appear to show that expenditures are decreasing. Actually, according to the Associate Dean for Libraries, expenses formerly included in the seminary library budget (notably, those for electronic databases and electronic books) have been moved into the overall library budget. Librarians assured the site team that overall expenditures for library collections have remained steady or risen slightly during recent years.

5.2 Contribution to Teaching, Learning, and Research

The library contributes to teaching, learning, and research partly through building up its collections, with faculty suggestions assisting the librarian in searching for needed titles. The collection has experienced increased circulation in the past ten years when both New York campuses are included. The library also orients new faculty and administrators, as well as new students, to the services and collections offered by Alliance. The librarians have offered the first two information literacy workshops, which were positively received by faculty. The DMin readiness site team underlined the effectiveness of the library staff in preparing students and faculty to be life-long learners and teachers.

5.3 Partnership in Curriculum Development

The librarians are members of both undergraduate and graduate curriculum committees in Rockland (at the main Nyack campus). The director of the Alliance library at Nyack is a full voting member of the faculty and attends theological school faculty meetings, thus benefitting from and contributing to discussions about curricular changes. As already mentioned, the library staff takes a leadership role in the institution’s new emphasis on information literacy as part of its curricular structure for seminary students (as well as undergraduates).

5.4 Administration and Leadership

The Associate Director of Libraries manages the libraries division, including all Nyack campuses. The ADL reports to the Dean of Community Life and Learning, who reports to the provost; the
ADL is part of the Academic Advisory Council and the Provost’s Cabinet. The assertion by various persons at Nyack was that this structure prevented the provost from having too many direct reports. However, it seemed to the site team that this signaled a possible view of the library’s relative lack of importance in the institution.

A further confirmation of this possibility exists in the way, as the site team understands it, that budgets are prepared and submitted. No librarian at the theological school reported being asked for input into the budgeting process; the ADL did say that she meets with the Treasurer to discuss budgeting for the libraries as a whole.

Regarding assessment, the libraries have stated goals and presented a listing of the measures of assessment to determine whether they had met their goals and had contributed to the learning environment positively. The librarians also use comparative annual statistics, questionnaires, and graduate student surveys to assess their work (the assessments show that the work of the library staff is greatly valued by the students and faculty of the seminary).

5.5 Resources

The seminary library has gone from 5.4 staff in 1999-2000 to 2.6 staff in 2008-09. The decrease means that fewer people are available to manage key processes, such as cataloging, which (together with the implementation of a new online catalog in the WALDO libraries) meant that fewer books were cataloged in 2008-09 than in the years immediately preceding. The librarians are responding to these challenges constructively, proposing a writing center, collaborating with faculty on information literacy, and developing the library collections so far as funds allow. Again, this situation may be attributed to the lack of available funding in an institution that depends quite heavily on tuition income for its funding.

As for its physical resources, all libraries examined by the site team were in good condition. The library in Manhattan was quite full, having very little room to add new books. The site team calls attention to this situation in its recommendations (below), which recognize the need for new facilities in Manhattan where an expanded space for the library would be available.

Resources for informational technology are provided by the institution as a whole. Members of the IT team met with the site team and discussed their priorities, including a large strategic planning document which is in preparation, which emerged from their discussions with students, faculty and staff institution-wide in the previous academic year. The information technology services provided seem adequate for persons on the main campus. Discussions about the learning management software to be deployed are underway, as the limitations of the previous software (known as eCollege) have become apparent to some faculty members who spoke with the site team. The self-study commends the IT team for its responsiveness and its introduction of new ways of assisting in the educational process, such as the installation of a proxy server to make remote access to electronic library materials easier.

6. Faculty

Alliance Seminary has 18 full-time teaching faculty that serve their two New York campuses, as well as their Puerto Rico extension, in addition to numerous regular adjunct contributors to the curriculum. For the most part, they all have very good academic credentials, and many of them have significant ministry experience, whether in U.S. pastorates or in overseas mission work. In fact, several faculty members still hold local pastorates, which is the case especially for those who teach and live in New York City. Given the course load of 18 credit hours per year (3 courses per semester), and the fact that some faculty accept overloads, whether during the
semester or especially in the summer sessions, in order to both cover the curriculum and make ends meet in this region of high living expenses, this makes for a demanding bi-vocational faculty life. In addition, because of the costs of living in the region immediately surrounding the Nyack campus, as well as the Manhattan campus, most faculty live at distances that are difficult to bring them all together in ways that easily build a sense of community. Nonetheless, this is a very committed and loyal faculty. They seem to love teaching their diverse student body and especially teaching in the context of Alliance Seminary and the metropolitan New York area with all its rich opportunities for ministry and learning.

The theological scholarship of this faculty has increased since the last reaccreditation period in 2000. The faculty includes a theologian who has published two novels in German, a published historian of the Civil War figure John Brown, and three faculty at the Manhattan campus, who having earned academic doctorates have opted to enhance their preparation in urban ministry and spiritual formation by pursuing Doctor of Ministry degrees. Hopefully, some publications will come from those research efforts. Moreover, the visiting team believes that the research and writing strengths of this faculty – reflection on the practice of ministry from the perspective of all theological disciplines, not just the “practical” ones – might be an important contribution to theological education widely. Summer research grants for seminary faculty, which have been offered by the parent institution, Nyack College, more readily in the last few years, might be best focused in this direction.

Diversity in faculty composition has also been enhanced since the last accreditation visit, including the addition of two African American faculty members at the Manhattan campus. Additional Latino/a faculty members plus continuing the increased exchange and engagement between Rockland and Manhattan campus faculties, as well as the Puerto Rico extension site, would greatly contribute to this expressed interest in matching the diversity of the faculty with the wide diversity of the student body.

Finally, the Dean’s office of Alliance Seminary, together with the administration of Nyack College, has worked very hard to ensure a clear and consistent tenure process for seminary faculty. In fact, the seminary has the highest percentage of tenured faculty in the entire Nyack system. A good, updated faculty handbook clearly lays out tenure requirements and process, especially the connection between the seminary tenure committees and recommendations and the university-wide tenure committee. In addition, attempts have been made to increase salary ranges for all faculty, but especially those at the upper ranges of service (full professors), who salaries tend to lag behind their peers at other institutions in the region.

7. Student Services

The student services provided to Alliance seminary students at all campuses are directed by the institution’s student services personnel, who report to the Vice President for Enrollment. Some staff members are designated to work with graduate students; some are located in Manhattan, with others located in Puerto Rico. As the Self-Study notes, the challenge for the seminary is to provide the needed student services at all of its locations, especially since its community consists basically of commuting students in New York, though some reside on the Nyack campus.

7.1 Recruitment

The Director of Admissions leads the recruitment effort for the seminary, making targeted visits to colleges and distributing materials to churches and other organizations in the New York region. Tools developed to assist in the recruitment process for the seminary include its Web-
site, its print publications and catalog. Financial aid is targeted to academically excellent candidates, to candidates living in the five boroughs of New York City, and to candidates affiliated with the C&MA, especially those living outside the tri-state area.

7.2 Admission

The institution (including the seminary) publishes all admission criteria and uses those criteria to judge whom to admit. The diversity of students in the seminary, at all of its campuses, is remarkable, but (as admissions staff members pointed out to the site team) somewhat unsurprising given the diversity of the community in New York state. Diversity of students who are admitted is apparent so far as race, gender, national origin, denominational background, language, academic background, and age are concerned, as the self-study and its appendices show clearly, for the New York campuses. Students are required to sign the institution’s statement of faith as they matriculate. Though the sponsoring denomination, the C&MA, does not permit the ordination of women, nonetheless women are admitted into the MDiv and other degree programs without discrimination, and their education is intended to prepare them for the role to which they believe God is calling them.

The admissions staff members have the authority to offer admission to students, but they take cases in which they have questions about the prospective student’s candidacy to the Enrollment Management Committee.

7.3 Student Services

According to data given to the site team, there were 338 students at Rockland and 294 students in Manhattan in spring 2010, for a total of 632 students, taking a total of 5025 hours. Of these, 55 were new students. There were 126 students in Puerto Rico in the same semester, taking 726 hours. The number of students in the program in Ukraine was 18 (the final cohort); they were taking 108 hours.

Surveys of students find that some aspects of student services are highly regarded (admissions, financial aid, ease of scheduling courses, and spiritual formation). Some receive lower assessments by students (housing, extra-curricular/cultural activities, placement, and food service). It must be borne in mind that housing is only offered at the Rockland campus.

Students interviewed by the site team expressed concern for the lack of staff leadership in providing community life opportunities, such as chapel, prayer groups, and extra-curricular activities. Administrators of the seminary indicated that giving ongoing leadership in this area has varied, year by year, but agreed with the students that most community activities for students are now student-led and student-planned, when they occur.

Records of student admissions, course work attempted and completed, and other areas are maintained through use of a database known as Jenzibar. The registrar and information technology staff indicated that the database is backed up frequently and that off-campus storage of tapes is maintained and regularly checked. Security of the student records is more than adequate, through the system of permissions required (at various levels) to see any confidential part of a student record.

The seminary has two perhaps conflicting goals when it comes to tuition and fees. First, it desires to make seminary education affordable, especially since many students in Manhattan are entering seminary education while also having other employment, or face other financial challenges, including the cost of living in the New York City area. But also, the seminary is part
of an institution which derives its main support from tuition. MDiv tuition for 2008-2009 was $13,020, on the upper side of the peer institutions with which Alliance compares itself.

Financial counseling is offered to all students; financial aid is distributed based on a common need analysis system. In the ESQ profile, 76.9% of students ranked the seminary’s financial aid assistance as significant or greatly significant in their choice of school.

The process for handling student complaints (whether academic or non-academic) is documented in the Catalog. Students interviewed by the site team indicated that the seminary works with them in a forthright and caring way, and that policies are implemented consistently. That particular group of students was unaware of any cases of student complaints.

7.4 Placement

The seminary serves the C&MA denomination, which has its own placement process; its staff members visit the seminary regularly. The seminary also posts available ministry positions on its website. Faculty advisors also give assistance to students, and field education supervisors also often are helpful. Some students, especially in Manhattan and in Puerto Rico, are already involved in ministry careers of one kind or another, and thus do not require assistance for placement.

8. Authority and Governance

8.1 Authority

Alliance Theological Seminary is a school of Nyack College, an educational institution chartered by the Board of Regents of the State of New York. According to the self-study report, the College is chartered to offer the degrees of Master of Arts, Master of Professional Studies and Master of Divinity. The seminary has received preliminary approval from ATS to offer the DMin degree, but the Board of Regents of the State of New York has not yet given its approval to offer this degree. Nyack College is governed by a 26-member Board of trustees that operates according to a set of bylaws. Nyack College is the national college of the C&MA and Alliance is the official national seminary of this denomination. As such, two-thirds of the Board of Trustees (BOT) is required to be members of C&MA. The Faculty Handbook states that “The institution (College) is a wholly owned subsidiary of the Christian and Missionary Alliance” with the Board of Directors of the denomination having authority to initiate changes that pertain to the Faculty Handbook, as well as other domains.

According to the self-study report, the President and the BOT have ultimate authority for maintaining viability, vitality and integrity of the seminary. The BOT has a regular standing committee to give oversight to the seminary. Members of this committee are very supportive of the mission and leadership of the seminary; however, their primary concern is the welfare of the College. Because Alliance is embedded school within the current “university model” of existence, the site team encourages Alliance to give attention to the development of a Seminary Advisory Board (ATS Commission Standard 8, Section 8.1.2.2).

The BOT has a Trustee Development Committee which offers performance evaluation and professional development opportunities to the trustees. The site team noticed that trustees receive only basic orientation and limited individual evaluation. There is a need for intentional trustee development which includes professional development and evaluation of individual trustees, as well as the board as a whole.
8.2 Governance

The seminary is under the authority of the College President and four Vice Presidents who supervise their respective areas within the seminary. As of February 2004, Alliance faculty is a part of the institution-wide system of faculty governance that allows each school faculty to have full authority of the educational programs of their respective schools. The Provost and VP for Academic Affairs delegates academic authority to the Dean of the seminary. The Dean reports to the Provost and is a member of the President's Executive Team.

The Faculty Handbook clearly states the policies and procedures for faculty governance. The Employee Handbook covers policies and procedures covering all employees of the College. All policies and procedures equally affect faculty members at all sites of the seminary. In terms of application process for promotion, tenure, sabbatical leaves, etc., the administration might consider monitoring the balance between autonomy of the seminary faculty and authority of the College faculty as a whole.

The seminary faculty meets regularly and oversees the governance of the curricular aspects of the seminary. Although student input is sought on certain governance issues, they are not formally represented on any seminary committees at this time. The site team encourages Alliance to make every effort to integrate the two faculties in a stronger way using technology and increased faculty exchanges, and community building events.

9. Institutional Resources

After becoming a part of the College within the current university model in 2003, the seminary has enjoyed better institutional resources. The closer linkage has produced increased stability from year to year compared to the former days of layoffs and downsizing efforts as a free standing seminary. The College is described as "property rich and endowment poor." The debt is significant, but considered by the administration as manageable due to the asset debt ratio. The institution claims assets in real estate valued at between $50 and $60 million. It is $10 million in debt. Primarily a tuition-driven institution, the College has operated in the red three times in the last ten years. The self-study report presents this fact in a positive manner, but the financial threat facing the institution is real, especially because of the possibility of losing all or part of the current denominational subsidy. The institution follows a realistic enrollment planning model which has enhanced its ability to do financial planning. The College also has developed a plan to cope with the reduction or elimination of financial support from the denomination. The viability of this plan has not been evaluated.

9.1 Human Resources

The seminary has 18 full-time faculty and 12 full-time staff at three campuses. The institution claims that its Human Resources policies and procedures are governed by its core value of serving the employees by "affirming their diversity and wide ranging global perspectives." Service at the Seminary is presented as an opportunity for ministry.

The college's HR office currently carries out most of the personnel functions that had been previously carried out by the seminary Dean's office. An Employee Handbook spells out policies related to all employees of the College. The Faculty Handbook which was developed by the college and seminary faculty under the auspices of the Office of the Provost outlines the policies and procedures governing faculty hiring, promotion, tenure, and ongoing evaluation and development. The Handbook also contains policies regarding grievance and termination. Faculty
salary scale and criteria governing salary calculations are also included in the Handbook. Both Handbooks have been approved by the Board of Trustees in 2009 and are available in print and online.

9.2 Financial Resources

The seminary is basically tuition-driven, with about a $700,000 subsidy from the sponsoring denomination, which may cease or diminish in the near future due to the financial condition of the denomination. The Executive Vice President and Treasurer (EVPT) testifies that the College is thoroughly committed to supporting the Seminary’s mission by keeping its tuition affordable and by subsidizing the cost of theological education. The Dean of the seminary meets with the EVPT to plan the seminary’s budget based on a Budget Planning Calendar. The EVPT reports to the BOT on the financial matters of the seminary as a significant cost center that covers about one tenth of the College’s overall budget.

The site team is very concerned about the low level of the endowment fund and the high dependence on tuition revenue at Nyack College. The team cannot testify that the institution has the ability to respond to financial emergencies resulting from unexpected drop in enrollment or other unforeseen circumstances. The team is pleased that the trustees are aware of the gravity of the situation, but expresses concern about the exclusive focus of the President and the development office on the Manhattan Miracle project (in which the College and Seminary are seeking a new location in Manhattan to offer expanded educational services, and for which the President is seeking major gifts). Even if a new facility is obtained in NYC through one or more “transformational gifts,” plans must be made to avoid going from “land rich” to “building rich” and still being “cash poor.” The team encourages that serious attention be given to reducing dependence on tuition as the predominant source of income. The team strongly recommends identifying and pursuing other sources of income for operations.

9.3 Physical Resources

The seminary in Nyack is housed in the former national headquarters of the C&MA. This well-maintained facility and the five dormitory/apartment buildings are debt-free. The seminary in NYC is housed in rental spaces at two locations. The seminary in Puerto Rico is housed in a newly purchased building. There is sufficient room in each location for classrooms, library, offices and student services. All locations have classrooms with IT facilities. Plans are under way to rent additional space in NYC or to purchase a larger facility through a special campaign to grow both the undergraduate and seminary programs there. All seminary facilities currently appear to be well maintained but commuter student parking is a significant concern.

10. Multiple Locations and Distance Education

10.1 Purpose

10.2 Multiple Locations (Extension Sites)

a. Manhattan:

Because standards 1-9 above contain all significant references to the work of the seminary done at the Manhattan campus, which is an extension campus of the Alliance Theological Seminary, it will not be fully treated again here. Two members of the visiting team visited the Manhattan campus for most of a day, including interviews with the Associate Dean for the Manhattan campus, the librarian, a group of students and alumni, and members of the Manhattan campus
faculty. As indicated in the Self-Study and by conversations at both campuses, the Manhattan faculty members were involved fully in the preparation of the Self Study; the seminary used the occasion to create more intentional discussions of its faculty in both locations.

b. Puerto Rico:

Puerto Rico Extension of Alliance Theological Seminary

Alliance Theological Seminary began its operation in San Juan, Puerto Rico, in 1996. The extension site is referred to in Puerto Rico as Seminario Teologico de Puerto Rico (STPR). The Theological Seminary of Puerto Rico fulfills its mission of providing a contextually-based theological education for Spanish speaking students from the Caribbean islands.

Visit Overview

The week following the Rockland and Manhattan visits, a two-member site team spent a full day at the Theological Seminary of Puerto Rico in San Juan. The executive director of the site took the team on a tour of the facilities, which were acquired in 2008. The team examined library resources and technology capabilities. The executive director of the site gave an informative presentation on the seminary that included data on the social realities of Puerto Rico, enrollment trends for the seminary, and the expanded number of denominations served by the extension site. Interviews were conducted with the executive director of the San Juan site, administrative assistant, financial officer and building administrator, librarian, program coordinator, students, professors, and the Dean of Alliance Theological Seminary.

The visiting team appreciated the warm welcome and gracious hospitality displayed by the staff at the Theological Seminary of Puerto Rico. Their team spirit and commitment to the seminary contribute to its success.

Theological Seminary of Puerto Rico continues to grow even in the midst of economic challenges. The extension seminary recognizes the need to keep theological education affordable. The Christian Missionary and Alliance denomination pays 50% of tuition for students within the denomination (and oftentimes local Alliance congregations which the students attend pick up the other half). A credit at the extension school will be $135 in the coming academic year, up from $125. This is comparable or below other graduate costs on the island. The site director and other staff give attention to raising funds to assist students with tuition, but there is little other financial aid available from the seminary, although payments plans are available.

General Institutional Standards

The faculty, administration, and staff help make Theological Seminary of Puerto Rico a vibrant place for the training of Christian leaders. The seminary serves as a full-degree site for the Master of Professional Studies and the Master of Divinity. Counseling is the largest focus area in both degree programs. This emphasis on counseling provides an avenue for the seminary to address some of the social realities in Puerto Rico. Graduates of the seminary also serve in churches, in the mission field, in the military as chaplains, and in other areas of ministry.

The Puerto Rico extension site maintains close relations with the main campus regarding all areas of its operations including strategic planning, curriculum, library resources, technical services, faculty, admissions, student services, governance, and finance. The site director is committed to working closely with the main campus with all academic and administrative
processes. The Dean of Alliance Theological Seminary is fully supportive of the executive director and the ministry of the Puerto Rico site.

The students expressed appreciation for the faculty and the collaborative learning environment at the Puerto Rico site. They benefit from classrooms that are equipped with adequate technology for the teaching and learning experience. Wireless connection is available in each classroom.

The library, while having grown significantly since the last comprehensive visit in 2000, still needs to be “freshened up” with an updated collection and continued growth. Moreover, there does not seem to be a clear collection policy or budget process for the library that allows the faculty and librarian to work closely together to ensure appropriate selection of books and other materials in a timely way including both Spanish and English language resources. The librarian’s role in the collection policy development and budget arrangement, in particular, needs to be clarified. The site team recommends requiring a report by November 1, 2011, for the Puerto Rico site, to clarify the collection policy regarding the number and quality of resources needed to achieve the purposes of the educational programs. The institution must also clarify the role of the faculty and librarian in Puerto Rico in building the library collection, developing the budget, and maintaining library services. (ATS Commission Standard 10, section 10.2.4).

The Puerto Rico campus has begun to implement indirect measures of assessment of faculty and students. An existing staff member has been assigned to assessment and is receiving training. However, attention needs to be given in terms of developing direct measures appropriate for program level assessment. The site team recommends requiring a report for the Puerto Rico site, to include evidence that the assessment there has been integrated into the assessment plan at the main campus in Nyack. The report also needs to include evidence of the assessment process that includes: program level goals or outcomes; a system of gathering information related to the desired goals that includes both direct and indirect measures; assessment results; and the establishment of revised goals or outcomes based on those results. (ATS Commission Standard 10, section 10.2.2).

Additional Observations

The site visit team would like to highlight several areas of commendation:

1. The diverse student body and faculty contribute to the rich learning environment.

2. Relationships and communication between the main campus in Nyack and the San Juan extension site appear to be open, collegial, and supportive.

3. The San Juan site has an excellent staff, especially the extension site director, who serves as a visionary leader. The long-time administrative assistant is now willing to take on the challenging tasks of admissions and assessment. The program coordinator excels at the functions of registrar, course scheduling, and student advising. The fiscal officer offers his expertise in the areas of finance, budget, and facilities maintenance.

4. The faculty seems to find great delight in and shows firm commitment to teaching at the San Juan site while also holding down several other teaching and ministry positions on the
island. They have very good academic credentials, excellent teaching and ministry experience, and creative research agendas.

5. The students are highly qualified and enthusiastic. They speak well of the seminary and have clear plans for how they will use their degrees upon graduation from the San Juan site.

6. The facility is adequate and comfortable, providing good office and classroom space with room to grow. The ability to purchase this building with a low mortgage after selling their previous property has facilitated manageable property expenses in a tight economy. The extension site benefits from the commitment of the main campus to pay the $4,000 per month mortgage.

The site visit team would like to highlight two areas of needed growth during the next period of accreditation:

1. Curricular concerns around contextualized courses for Puerto Rico might be ameliorated by some program modification discussions between the Puerto Rico faculty and the Alliance Theological Seminary Dean and faculty in New York. (Degree Program Standard A, section A.3.1.4, and section C.3.1.1.4 through section c.3.1.1.4.3).

2. While the Puerto Rico site seems to have the three legs of the parent campus field education program (spiritual formation, field placement, and mentored development), better articulation and attention toward the latter two pieces may enhance the program at the Puerto Rico extension. (Degree Program Standard A, section A.3.1.4, and section C.3.1.1.4 through section c.3.1.1.4.3).

10.3 Distance Education

The seminary does offer some of its classes online, but no degree program allows the counting of more than half of the courses in an online format. There has been an effort to get MDiv core courses into an online format, but the seminary suggests that progress has been slow, with only three courses currently available. The MAIC degree is developing a greater online presence, because the sponsoring C&MA denomination wishes its missionaries to be able to take a hybrid program for missionary training, using their year of leave and combining it with another year of online work. This is a direction discussed in the Self-Study, but not yet fully enacted.

IV. COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS

The Evaluation Committee recommends to the Board of Commissioners the following actions:

1. To reaffirm accreditation of Alliance Theological Seminary for a period of ten years (spring 2020).

2. To approve the following degree programs:

   Master of Divinity
   Master of Arts in Intercultural Studies
   Master of Professional Studies
   Master of Arts (Biblical Literature)
   Doctor of Ministry (preliminary)
3. To approve the following extension sites and distance learning program:
   
   a. To grant approval to offer the MDiv, the Master of Professional Studies, and the MA (Biblical Literature) at an extension site in New York, New York.
   b. To grant approval to offer the MDiv and the Master of Professional Studies at an extension site in San Juan, Puerto Rico.
   c. To grant approval to offer a comprehensive distance education program (preliminary).

4. To encourage that attention be given to maintaining and enhancing the following distinctive strengths:
   
   a. Diversity of students and faculty.
   b. Commitment to education in the urban setting.
   c. Support provided to churches through trans-denominational education.
   d. Commitment to assessment.
   e. Field education and mentoring program.

5. To encourage that attention be given to the following areas of needed growth during the next period of accreditation:
   
   a. Dependence on tuition as the predominant source of income; we express concern that other areas of income need to be identified and pursued (ATS Commission Standard 9, sections 9.2.1.1 and 9.2.4).
   b. Improvement and expansion of the facilities in Manhattan, especially the library (ATS Commission Standard 9, section 9.3.1 and 9.3.3).
   c. Scholarship as evidenced in publications particularly making a contribution to enhance praxis (ATS Commission Standard 6, section 6.4.1).
   d. Community building at all campuses (Degree Program Standard A, section A.4.2.1).
   e. Development of a seminary advisory board (ATS Commission Standard 8, section 8.1.2.2).
   f. Curricular concerns around contextualized courses for Puerto Rico might be ameliorated by some program modification discussions between the Puerto Rico faculty and the Alliance Theological Seminary Dean and faculty in New York. (Degree Program Standard A, section A.3.1.4, and section C.3.1.1.4 through section c.3.1.1.4.3).
   g. While the Puerto Rico site seems to have the three legs of the parent campus field education program (spiritual formation, field placement, and mentored development), better articulation and attention toward the latter two pieces may enhance the program at the Puerto Rico extension. (Degree Program Standard A, section A.3.1.4, and section C.3.1.1.4 through section c.3.1.1.4.3).

6. To take action regarding the following areas of needed improvement:
   
   a. To require a report by November 1, 2011, for the Puerto Rico site, to clarify the collection policy regarding the number and quality of resources needed to achieve the purposes of the educational programs. The institution must also clarify the role of the faculty and librarian in Puerto Rico in building the library collection, developing the budget, and maintaining library services. (ATS Commission Standard 10, section 10.2.4).
   
   b. To require a report by November 1, 2012, regarding:
      1. The assessment for the "re-engineered" MDiv degree (ATS Commission Standard 1, section 1.2.2 and Degree Program Standard A, section A.5).
      2. For the Puerto Rico site, evidence that the assessment there has been
integrated into the assessment plan at the main campus in Nyack. The report also needs to include evidence of the assessment process that includes: program level goals or outcomes; a system of gathering information related to the desired goals that includes both direct and indirect measures; assessment results; and the establishment of revised goals or outcomes based on those results. (ATS Commission Standard 10, section 10.2.2).